

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

-----  
JOEL RICH and MARY RICH,

Plaintiffs,

v.

FOX NEWS NETWORK, LLC, MALIA  
ZIMMERMAN in her individual and professional  
capacities, and ED BUTOWSKY, in his individual  
and professional capacities,

Defendants.  
-----

X

: Civil Action No. 1:18-cv-02223  
: (GBD)(SN)

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

:

X

**DECLARATION OF ELI J. KAY-OLIPHANT IN SUPPORT OF  
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO SEAL**

I, Eli J. Kay-Oliphant, hereby declare as follows:

1. I am a partner at the law firm of Massey & Gail LLP, counsel of record for Plaintiffs Mary Rich and Joel Rich. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this declaration and make this declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Motion to Seal.

2. Exhibit 2, attached to the Declaration of Eli J. Kay-Oliphant, and filed in support of Plaintiffs' Opposition to Fox News Network, LLC's and Malia Zimmerman's Second Motion to Dismiss, was designated confidential in *Rich v. Butowsky, et al.*, 18-cv-681-RJL (D.D.C.).

3. Exhibit 3, attached to the Declaration of Eli J. Kay-Oliphant, and filed in support of Plaintiffs' Opposition to Fox News Network, LLC's and Malia Zimmerman's Second Motion to Dismiss, was designated confidential in this matter.

4. Exhibit 4, attached to the Declaration of Eli J. Kay-Oliphant, and filed in support of Plaintiffs' Opposition to Fox News Network, LLC's and Malia Zimmerman's Second Motion to Dismiss, was designated confidential in this matter.

I declare under the penalty of perjury and pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746 that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed this 28<sup>th</sup> Day of February, 2020

/s/ Eli J. Kay-Oliphant

Eli J. Kay-Oliphant

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify this 28th day of February, 2020 that I caused a true and correct copy of the foregoing document to be electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification to the attorneys of record.

*s/ Eli J. Kay-Oliphant*

Eli J. Kay-Oliphant